

PLANNING COMMITTEE

MINUTES

11 OCTOBER 2011

Chairman: * Councillor Keith Ferry

Councillors: * Stephen Greek * Jerry Miles (4)

* Thaya Idaikkadar
* Nizam Ismail (3)
* Simon Williams (1)

* Denotes Member present

(1), (3) and (4) Denote category of Reserve Members

182. Attendance by Reserve Members

RESOLVED: To note the attendance at this meeting of the following duly appointed Reserve Members:-

Ordinary Member Reserve Member

Councillor Bill Phillips Councillor Jerry Miles
Councillor Anthony Seymour Councillor Simon Williams
Councillor William Stoodley Councillor Nizam Ismail

183. Right of Members to Speak

RESOLVED: That, in accordance with Committee Procedure Rule 4.1, the following Councillors, who were not Members of the Committee, be allowed to speak on the agenda items indicated:

Councillor Planning Application

James Bond 1/09, 1/10, 1/11 – Rayners Hotel, Christopher Noyce 23 Village Way East, Harrow, HA2 7LX

184. Declarations of Interest

RESOLVED: To note that there were no declarations of interests made.

185. Minutes

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the meeting held on 27 September 2011 be deferred to the next meeting.

186. Public Questions, Petitions and Deputations

RESOLVED: To note that no public questions were put, or petitions or deputations received at this meeting.

187. References from Council and other Committees/Panels

RESOLVED: There were none.

188. Representations on Planning Applications

RESOLVED: That it be noted that no representations had been received.

RESOLVED ITEMS

189. Planning Applications Received

In accordance with the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985, the Addendum was admitted late to the agenda as it contained information relating to various items on the agenda and was based on information received after the despatch of the agenda. It was admitted to the agenda in order to enable Members to consider all information relevant to the items before them for decision.

RESOLVED: That authority be given to the Divisional Director of Planning to issue the decision notices in respect of the applications considered.

BENTLEY PRIORY, THE COMMON, STANMORE, HA7 3HH (APPLICATION 1/01)

Reference: P/1840/11 – (City & Country Homes Ltd). First Floor Extension to Building 7 and Conversion to 5 Dwellinghouses; External Alterations (Amendments to Planning Permission P/1452/08CFU dated 16/09/2010 to Provide 2 Additional Dwellinghouses, Enlargement of First Floor Extension and Amendments to External Alterations).

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

BENTLEY PRIORY, THE COMMON, STANMORE, HA7 3HH (APPLICATION 1/02)

Reference: P/1909/11- (City & Country Homes Ltd). Listed Building Consent: Internal and External Alterations and Addition of First Floor to Building 7 to Provide 5 Houses (2 Additional Units to Plans Approved by P/1452/08/CFU).

DECISION: GRANTED listed building consent as described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant listed building consent was unanimous.

BENTLEY PRIORY, THE COMMON, STANMORE, HA7 3HH (APPLICATION 1/03)

Reference: P/1841/11 – (City & Country Homes Ltd). Part Demolition and Conversion of Building 267 to 7 Flats; External Alterations to Fenestration and Insertion of Rooflights (Amendments to Planning Permission P/1452/08CFU dated 16/09/2010 to Retain the Building Instead of Replacing the Building with 3 New Dwellinghouses).

In response to a question regarding stacking, it was noted that the application related to a former Ministry of Defence property built to a high specification.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

BENTLEY PRIORY, THE COMMON, STANMORE, HA7 3HH (APPLICATION 1/04)

Reference: P/1061/11 – (City & Country Homes Ltd). Listed Building Consent: Removal of Parts of the Curtilage Listed Building Abutting the Orangery and Main Bentley Priory Building and Associated Making Good. External Alterations Including Modifications to Existing Window Openings and Internal Alterations.

DECISION: GRANTED listed building consent as described on the application and submitted plans, subject to informatives.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant listed building consent was unanimous.

BENTLEY PRIORY, THE COMMON, STANMORE, HA7 3HH (APPLICATION 1/05)

Reference: P/1842/11 – (City & Country Homes Ltd). Conversion of Dining Room Block to 4 Flats with Basement Parking; External Alterations (Amendments to Planning Permission P/1452/08CFU dated 16/09/2010 to Provide 3 Additional Flats, Addition of Basement Parking and Amendments to External Alterations).

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

BENTLEY PRIORY, THE COMMON, STANMORE, HA7 3HH (APPLICATION 1/06)

Reference: P/1059/11 – (City & Country Homes Ltd). Listed Building Consent: Amendment of Internal Arrangements and Fenestration to the Dining Room Block which will Result in Modifications to the Proposals Covered by the Existing Consent (Our Ref: P/1453/08).

DECISION: GRANTED listed building consent as described on the application and submitted plans, subject to informatives.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant listed building consent was unanimous.

BENTLEY PRIORY, THE COMMON, STANMORE, HA7 3HH (APPLICATION 1/07)

Reference: P/1946/11 – (Mr Richard Winsborough). Listed Building Consent: Proposed Internal Alterations Comprising Alterations to the Layout Within the Main Mansion House for the Formation Of Residential Units.

DECISION: GRANTED listed building consent as described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant listed building consent was unanimous.

FORMER GOVERNMENT OFFICES, HONEYPOT LANE, STANMORE, HA7 1BB (APPLICATION 1/08)

Reference: P/1731/11 – (St Edward Homes). Variation of Condition 1 attached to Planning Permission P/1450/08CFU Dated 21/07/2008 to Enable the Temporary Hardstanding to Remain in Place for a Further 3 Years.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

RAYNERS HOTEL, 23 VILLAGE WAY EAST, HARROW, HA2 7LX (APPLICATIONS 1/09, 1/10, 1/11)

Reference: P/1018/11 – (Cycle Screen Ltd). Outline Application for Access, Appearance, Layout and Scale: Construction of a Ground Floor Plus Four Storey Building, with Parking Spaces, Servicing Area and Refuse Storage at Lower Ground Floor Level; 801m2 Retail (Use Class A1) Floorspace at Ground Floor Level; and 28 Residential Units (28 X 1 Bed) Above; Relocation of Access Steps on Imperial Drive and Additional Use of the Public House Building (A3/A4 With Ancillary C3 + D2) for the Purposes Of Use Class D1[C] (Education). (Resident Parking Permit Restricted).

Reference: P/1083/11 – (Cycle Screen Ltd). Outline Application for Access, Appearance, Layout and Scale: Construction of a Ground Floor Plus Four Storey Building, with Parking Spaces, and Refuse Storage at Lower Ground Floor Level; 448m2 of Mixed Use Floorspace (A1/A2/A3/A5/B1/D1(C) (Education) and 3 Residential Units (1 X Studio, 1 X 1 Bed And 1 X 2 Bed) at Ground Floor Level; and 28 Residential Units (1 X Studio, 1 X 2 Bed And 26 X 1 Bed) Above; Relocation of Access Steps on Imperial Drive and Additional Use of the Public House Building (A3/A4 With Ancillary C3 + D2) for the Purposes of Use Class D1[C] (Education). (Resident Parking Permit Restricted).

Reference: P/1017/11 – (Cycle Screen Ltd). Listed Building Consent: Proposed External and Internal Alterations Including: Demolitions (Including Retrospective Removal of Snug Screens and Proposed Removal of Internal Lobby; Proposed Installation of New Partitions (Including Infilling of Bar Openings) and Floor Mounted Walls; Removal of Signs; Repairs to Wooden Panelling; Installation of Disabled Access; Redecoration; New Bollards; Refurbished and New Electrics; Ceiling Repairs; New Lighting; Replacement Floor Coverings; Refurbishment of Heating System (Including New Radiators); New Locking System to Doors; Repair of Windows; Installation of CCTV and Security Detection; Installation of Fire Escape Signage; Boundary Treatment Alterations.

The officer reported that an external and internal site visit had taken place regarding the three applications in relation to the Rayners Hotel. A grade 2 listed building for several years, it was an 'at risk' building on the English Heritage list. The first two applications proposed enabling development which included a consented extension to an adjoining building, the owners of which were keen to pursue. The third scheme offered a slightly different commercial offer on the ground floor. Officers had been advised that the site had been offered to 180 public house owners, in various states of repair, and also to agents.

In relation to the application for part educational use, the Chairman referred to emerging draft planning policies within the Development Management DPD which, in his view, were material. In particular policies 7 (with regard to changes of use that preserved the building) and 41 (regarding the loss of a public house which was no longer economically viable and where a reasonable attempt to market had to be made). He expressed a preference for the removal of the education use should a public house or community use be feasible. It was proposed and seconded that the three applications be deferred to enable discussion between the officers and applicant with a view to requiring, either by condition or section 106 Agreement, that the public house be refurbished and marketed and only if it was established that there was no market for a public house would consideration be given to an alternative use.

DECISION: DEFERRED to enable discussion between the officers and Applicant.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the voting was as follows:

Councillors Keith Ferry, Thaya Idaikkadar, Nizam Ismail and Jerry Miles voted to approve the deferment.

Councillors Stephen Greek, Joyce Nickolay and Simon Williams abstained.

TEMPLE HOUSE, 221 - 225 STATION ROAD, HARROW, HA1 2TH (APPLICATION 1/12)

Reference: P/2224/11 - (M P & G Trading). Demolition of Existing Three Storey Office Building on Greenhill Way and Two Storey Office Building on Fairholme Road; Redevelopment of Site for New Part 2, Part 3, & Part 4 Storey Building Comprising a 101 Bedroom Hotel (Class C1) with Cafe/Bar (Class A3/A4); Refuse & Cycle Storage.

The Chairman reported that a site visit had taken place. It was noted that the project had an extant planning permission.

In response to a question, the officer indicated the line of the approved and proposed applications. It was moved and seconded that the application be refused for the following reason:

'That the development be refused as the BRE No Sky Line test does not reach the 0.8 target for all windows which would have a detrimental effect on the visual amenity of the residents in the properties of nos. 5-7 Fairholme Road, particularly no.5, according to Harrow's UDP policy DS.C.'

An officer stated that there would be no additional transgressions (over and above the approved scheme) in respect of Building Research Establishment (BRE) standards in relation to gardens or windows at these properties.

Upon being put to the vote the motion was lost. The grant of the application was put to the vote and carried.

DECISION:

- (1) GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, subject to conditions and informatives reported, and the completion of a Section 106 Agreement with Head of Terms as set out in the report by 4 November 2011;
- the delegation to the Divisional Director, Planning in consultation with the Director of Legal and Governance Services, for the sealing of the Section 106 Agreement and to agree any minor amendments to the conditions or the legal agreement be approved;
- (3) should the Section 106 Agreement not be completed by 4 November 2011, the decision to REFUSE planning permission be delegated to the Divisional Director, Planning for the reasons set out in the report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the voting was as follows:

Councillors Keith Ferry, Thaya Idaikkadar, Nizam Ismail and Jerry Miles voted to approve the application.

Councillors Stephen Greek, Joyce Nickolay and Simon Williams voted against approval of the application.

103 GREENFORD ROAD, HARROW, HA1 3QF (APPLICATION 2/01)

Reference: P/1938/11 – (Mr Leon Peng Zhang). Change of Use From an Office to Provide an Educational Facility (Class B1 to Class D1) (Retrospective Application).

In response to a question, it was noted that an informative advised that the advertisement erected on the front elevation of the building required Listed Building Consent.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

25 - 27 PINNER GREEN, PINNER, HA5 2AF (APPLICATION 2/02)

Reference: P/1333/11 – (Harrow Mencap). Change of Use from Office to a Non Residential (Educational) Purposes (Class B1 to D1).

It was noted that the Applicants had served notice on Harrow Council, the owner of the property, and that Certificate B had been signed.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the certificate was unanimous.

92 CANNING ROAD WEALDSTONE, HA3 7SN (APPLICATION 2/03)

Reference: P/2035/11 – (Ms Kilroy). Certificate of Lawful Existing Development: Rear Dormer and Installation of 2 No Rooflights in Front Slope, Extension of Soil and Vent Pipe at Rear.

It was noted that the application had been reported to the Committee because the applicant was a Council employee.

DECISION: GRANTED the Certificate of Lawful Proposed Development as described on the application and submitted plans.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the certificate was unanimous.

BIRO HOUSE, 110 STANLEY ROAD, SOUTH HARROW, HA2 8UW (APPLICATION 2/04)

Reference: P/1900/11 – (ZEDHOMES Properties LLP). Change Of Use And Conversion Of Parts Of Basement, Ground, First And Second Floors From Office Use To 8 Self Contained Flats (Class B1 To C3); 14 Car Parking Spaces, Cycle Storage, Refuse And Balcony Amenity Space (Resident Permit Restricted).

The Chairman reported that a site visit had taken place.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

81 BURNT OAK BROADWAY, EDGWARE, HAS 5EP (APPLICATION 2/05)

Reference: P/2143/11 – (Paddy Power Ltd). Removal of Condition 3 attached to Planning Permission E3537/6226 (Brent Council) dated 29/11/1973 to Allow Unrestricted Class A2 Use.

It was noted that Condition 3 restricted use of the premises for a Building Society Office only. The proposed use was also an A2 use.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the voting was as follows:

Councillors Keith Ferry, Thaya Idaikkadar, Nizam Ismail and Jerry Miles voted to approve the application.

Councillors Stephen Greek, Joyce Nickolay and Simon Williams abstained.

SERVICE STATION, 103 – 105 PINNER ROAD, HARROW, HA1 4EU (APPLICATION 2/06)

Reference: P/1512/11- (Mr P Patel). New Mezzanine Floor to Provide Additional Storage to One Side and a Kitchen to Other Side.

It was noted that representations regarding an unidentified smell had been referred to Environmental Health for investigation and action as necessary.

DECISION: That the Divisional Director Planning be authorised to determine planning permission for the development described in the application and submitted plans, as amended by the addendum, after the notification period expired on 19 October 2011.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to delegate the application was unanimous

BENTLEY HYDE, PRIORY DRIVE, STANMORE, HA7 3HN (APPLICATION 2/07)

Reference: P/1952/11 – (Mr Richard Hershman). Demolition of Existing Dwellinghouse and Erection of Replacement Two Storey Detached Dwellinghouse with Rooms in Roofspace and Integral Garage; Two Single Storey Detached Outbuildings and a Swimming Pool in the Rear Garden; Front Boundary Wall and Gates.

DECISION: GRANTED permission for the application as described on the application and submitted plans, subject to conditions and informatives reported.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to grant the application was unanimous.

5 SOUTH CLOSE, PINNER, HA5 5AE (APPLICATION 2/08)

Reference: P/0694/11 – (Mr. Safdar Abbasi). Single and Two Storey Side and Rear Extension; New Roof over Front Entrance; Side And Rear Dormers.

DECISION: REFUSED permission for the development described on the application and submitted plans for the reasons set out in the report.

The Committee wished it to be recorded that the decision to refuse the application was unanimous.

190. Scheme of Delegation and Member Protocol

The Committee received a report of the Divisional Director, Planning which sought approval to an updated scheme of delegation and a member protocol for the call in of Planning applications.

It was noted that an amended appendix 1 had been circulated which highlighted the changes proposed. It was agreed that further time was required to consider the proposals in detail.

RESOLVED: That consideration of the report be deferred.

191. Consultation Draft - Enforcement Policy and Prosecution & Direct Action Policy

The Committee received and considered the Draft Planning Enforcement Policy and the Draft Planning Prosecution and Direct Action Policy.

Following the consultation period of six weeks, any necessary revisions on the basis of feedback received would be made and final versions would be reported to the Planning Committee and subsequently to Cabinet for adoption.

In response to questions it was noted that:

- the policies sought to strengthen the ability of the Council to respond to Planning breaches;
- the officers would revise the document to reflect the timescales for acknowledgements contained in the Council's Complaints;
- the initial acknowledgement would include a named contact and be used for monitoring purposes;
- planning enforcement was a discretionary function.

RESOLVED: That the Draft Planning Enforcement Policy and the Draft Planning Prosecution and Direct Action Policy be referred to Cabinet for public consultation.

192. INFORMATION REPORT - Appeals and Enforcement Update Summary

The Committee received summary information in relation to appeals determined for January to June 2011. It provided information on complaints received, complaints closed, enforcement notices served and prosecution for period January to September 2011.

RESOLVED: That the report be noted.

193. Member Site Visits

RESOLVED: To note that there were no site visits to be arranged.

(Note: The meeting, having commenced at 6.30 pm, closed at 8.00 pm).

(Signed) COUNCILLOR KEITH FERRY Chairman